

Passive Voice Teaching: Recent Trends and Effective Strategies

Nagamurali Eragamreddy*

English Language Unit, Preparatory Studies Centre, University of Technology and Applied Sciences, Salalah, Sultanate of Oman

Received: 10.03.2024 • Accepted: 19.04.2024 • Published: 23.04.2024 • Final Version: 28.04.2024

Abstract: This study investigates current practices and useful methods for teaching passive voice. To find effective teaching strategies, a thorough review of the literature produced between 2018 and 2024 was undertaken. Using keywords associated with passive voice instruction, data was gathered from academic sources, and thirty pertinent papers were chosen for examination. The Experience, Generalization, Reinforcement, Application (EGRA) method, task-based learning, cooperative learning, flashcards, and web-based storytelling are just a few of the successful teaching techniques that thematic analysis identified. These strategies improve learning outcomes, comprehension, and student engagement. It was stressed that context-based learning is crucial to knowing when and how to employ passive voice. It has been discovered that technology, especially web-based storytelling, increases student engagement and recall of material. Students' memory and understanding were also enhanced by the Jigsaw method and inductive training. In general, it was discovered that teaching passive voice may be accomplished effectively using a range of teaching techniques, such as active learning and technology integration. To learn more about these strategies' long-term consequences and how they affect different student demographics, more study is required.

Keywords: passive voice teaching, EGRA method, task-based learning, cooperative learning, web-based storytelling

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

There is a great deal of disagreement in second language acquisition (SLA) and allied fields of research over the precise scope of grammar instruction's short-term and long-term impacts as well as the cognitive functions it stimulates. Nonetheless, the majority of modern researchers concur that this type of training may have some limited benefits for the growth of language knowledge, particularly that which is obvious and proactive, as well as possibly for that which is implied and unintentional (De Graaff & Hausen, 2009; Doughty, 2003; Nassaji & Fotos, 2011). The classic structuralist framework, which frequently ignores the conceptual aspect of grammar by treating it only in a broad sense or disregarding significant portions thereof, is the source of the grammatical descriptions that underlie form-focused teaching in a wide range of situations (Bielak & Pawlak, 2013). But in recent years, interest has been resurgent in understanding and instructional application of further meaning-oriented models

* Corresponding Author: Nagamurali.Eragamreddy@utas.edu.om; muralieragamreddi@gmail.com

of language, like cognitive linguistics (Geeraerts, 2006) and systems-based functional linguistics (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2013). In linguistics literature, the practice of the two types of voices in the English language has been covered in great detail. The connection between the “subject and the verb” of a statement is referred to as voice (Oshima & Hogue, 2007). Using active voice statements, the verb expresses an event that the subject carries out. Sentences in the passive voice, on the other hand, provide the action to the subject. For instance:

Active voice: Lizzy calls Lidya.

Lidya is called by Lizzy.

The person performing the action determines whether **the voice is active or passive**. The verb "call" comes after the doer (Lizzy) in the active voice. In contrast, while using the passive voice, the doer (Lizzy) appears after the verb (is called) as a prepositional phrase, with the recipient of the action (Lidya) coming before it. The application and consequences of active voice compared to passive voice in the English language, have been the subject of several studies. Because it might obfuscate the action's doer and result in length, passive voice is frequently seen as an undesirable feature in academic English writing (Saeidi & Sahebkhair, 2011). Nevertheless, according to some research, using the passive voice appropriately in academic works has a crucial rhetorical purpose (Jalilifar & Shooshtari, 2011). Writers can follow disciplinary guidelines, exclude personal attribution, and highlight the most crucial material by using passive language. Professional authors in academia are seen to deliberately employ either kind of voice according to the circumstances, despite differing opinions on its advantages (Charles, 2013).

1.2 The Problem

The corpus of research on teaching passive voice is expanding, but there is still a lack of knowledge on the most recent and efficient techniques. Numerous studies now in existence concentrate on conventional methods without taking into account current developments or trends in language instruction techniques. For instance, there is little study on the integration of genuine materials and real-world situations to improve learning, even if some studies address the use of technology in teaching passive voice (Islamy & Kaniadewi, 2022; Shabani et al., 2016; Trajkovska, 2022; Diyata, 2022). By offering a thorough analysis of current developments and practical passive voice teaching techniques, this study seeks to close this gap and meet a critical need in the discipline of language education.

1.3 Significance of the Study

The goal of the current study is to close the knowledge gap between traditional approaches and the most recent developments in language training. To promote meaningful learning experiences, genuine materials and real-world events must be explored (Benson, 2013). The study can find novel techniques that enhance student comprehension and usage of the passive voice by examining current trends and successful strategies. To supplement conventional approaches, technology-assisted learning tools may be used (Healey, 2016). By giving them a useful arsenal of efficient passive voice teaching techniques, the findings can have a direct impact on language teachers' practices. This gives teachers the ability to incorporate these strategies into their lesson plans, which improves student performance (Aliakbari & Jamalvandi, 2010). Learner-centered strategies, which increase learning's interactivity and engagement, are frequently highlighted in current trends. This study can investigate strategies that take advantage of these developments to improve the effectiveness and enjoyment of

learning passive voice (Richards & Rodgers, 2014). The study opens the door for more research and advancement in passive voice education by examining current patterns. As language instruction develops further, this may result in the development of even more effective strategies (Cameron, 2001).

1.4 Goals of the Research

1. To examine current trends in passive voice instruction.
2. To determine which instructional methods for passive voice are most successful.
3. Investigate how to include real-world circumstances and realistic resources in passive voice instruction.
4. To investigate strategies for teaching passive voice that are learner-centered.
5. To assess how technology-assisted learning aids influence the teaching of passive voice.

1.5 Research Questions

1. What new directions are passive voice instruction taking?
2. What methods of teaching passive voice are successful?
3. How can real-world scenarios and realistic materials be included in passive voice instruction?
4. What learner-centered techniques can improve the teaching of passive voice?
5. How do technology-assisted learning aids influence the teaching of passive voice?
6. How can language instructors increase student performance by implementing these strategies into their lesson plans?

2. Literature Review

2.1 Overview of Passive Voice Teaching

Teaching pupils to develop and use sentences in which the subject receives the action instead of doing it is known as passive voice instruction. The body of study in this field is growing, but greater attention to current trends and practical strategies is required. While some research (Islamy & Kaniadewi, 2022) stresses the use of technology in passive voice education, others (Safarova, 2023), place more emphasis on the integration of genuine materials and real-world circumstances. Enhancing students' comprehension and use of passive voice structures is the goal of passive voice education, which frequently integrates learner-centered strategies (Zohrabi et al., 2012; Richards & Rodgers, 2014; Darsih, 2018).

2.2 Trends in Passive Voice Teaching

Nourdad & Aghayi's (2014) study investigates passive voice instruction strategies. In contrast to "focus on forms," which stresses applying grammar in communication, the research proposes a change towards "focus on form" strategies, where grammar is explicitly stated. Here, students who were explicitly taught the various passive voice tenses did better than those who were just exposed to it in a communicative context. This implies that to grasp difficult structures like the passive voice in EFL situations, there may be a tendency toward more direct grammar instruction. Yannuar et al. (2014) examine student theses to investigate a potential change in the use of the passive voice. According to their data, pupils are utilizing active voice more often than passive voice (64.8%). This may point to a tendency in academic writing toward more straight forward and clearer communication, which may have been inspired by

the writing styles of native English speakers. This suggests that the reliance on passive voice in academic writing teaching may need to be lessened. While acknowledging the current discussion around passive voice, Unver (2017) contends that EFL students should continue to become proficient in both active and passive voice. The research proposes a change from only encouraging active voice to one that focuses on increasing voice usage awareness. Assisting students with comprehending the subtle distinctions between active and passive voice in oral and written communication, as well as the situations in which each is most suitable, may fall under this category. This method gives students the tools they need to choose their voice usage wisely for efficient communication.

The use of passive voice is common in STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math) textbooks, as demonstrated by Luo's (2018) research. This shows that science and math students are increasingly being taught passive voice directly. The study's conclusion that there are notable differences in the practice of the passive voice in STEM fields suggests that education should be customized to meet the unique requirements of each discipline (e.g., emphasizing various verb forms used passively in each subject). This highlights how crucial it is for English language learners pursuing STEM disciplines to get passive voice training using discipline-specific methods. Crosthwaite and Steeples (2022) add to the expanding body of work on corpus-based language acquisition. According to their research, subject-specific teachers have a crucial role in subject-specific learning, and data-driven learning (DDL) can be beneficial for younger students. This study offers hope for the future of DDL in secondary education, even though there is still space for advancement in tool design and long-term use.

2.3 Effective Strategies in Passive Voice Teaching

The usefulness of the "jigsaw technique" in teaching passive voice is investigated in Hadi's (2023) study. With this approach, students study various aspects of an idea in cooperative groups and then share what they have learned with one another. The study discovered that when students used jigsaw puzzles, their usage of passive voice significantly improved. This shows that teaching and learning from one another in collaborative learning environments may help students acquire grammatical concepts like the passive voice. Effective methods for teaching passive voice through lesson study, a cooperative approach, were examined by Mallipa & Murianty (2020). According to their results, grammar should be taught using a text-based method once pupils have a firm grasp of the primary concepts. This highlights how crucial context and practical application are to grammar education. The study emphasizes the need to take students' past knowledge into account when choosing instructional materials and the usefulness of lesson study in discovering effective practices. The usefulness of "passive voice cards" in teaching passive voice to Indonesian EFL students is examined by Halim (2020). After utilizing these cards, the study discovered a considerable increase in student performance, indicating the cards' potential as a teaching aid. This illustrates one potential advantage of utilizing tactile or visual aids in grammar instruction: learners may find the idea of passive voice easier to understand.

According to this study by Pereira et al. (2019), teaching passive voice through collaborative learning is a successful strategy. After engaging in group projects, students' test results dramatically increased, demonstrating increased comprehension. This demonstrates how effective interactive learning techniques can be when teaching grammar. According to Amadi's (2018) research, students used "affective strategies"—strategies for controlling motivation and emotions—a lot when they were studying. This calls for the development of a nurturing learning environment that recognizes the difficulties that students encounter and

makes use of techniques to increase their self-assurance and interest in the subject matter. This could work better than just concentrating on grammatical exercises. The EGRA method for teaching passive voice is examined by Zaenap (2019). With this approach, students are first introduced to the idea, after which they are assisted in recognizing patterns, and finally, practice and application. Significant gains in student performance were seen in the study, indicating that this multi-step method may be useful for EFL students.

2.4 Challenges and Limitations in Passive Voice Teaching

As indicated by Jannah et al.'s research (2023), teaching passive voice presents several difficulties, including the necessity for pupils to possess a foundational understanding of grammar, little exposure to passive voice, and insufficient practice opportunities. These difficulties are further exacerbated by imprecise explanations, language transfer from native tongues, and a dearth of feedback. The study suggests concentrating on fundamental tense comprehension, boosting practice, giving students focused feedback, and exposing them to real materials to solve these problems. Teaching passive voice presents several difficulties, according to Alda Raudatul (2023): a poor grammatical basis, little exposure, and ambiguous explanations. The study emphasizes that for students to become proficient in passive voice creation, they must have a solid foundation in grammar in addition to plenty of practice and clear teaching. The difficulties students have with passive voice include subject/object interactions, verb tense variations, and sentence structure identification (Fitria & Muliasari, 2022). It's interesting to note that the study also raises the possibility that Indonesian pupils struggle more with passive voice since their native tongue lacks tenses. It is important to provide students with precise explanations of tense and sentence structure that are customized to their language proficiency.

According to Muziatun et al. (2022), the biggest problem for pupils with passive voice is utilizing the auxiliary word "be" (67% difficulty). This indicates that education on this particular grammatical component needs to be more targeted, maybe including additional exercises and detailed explanations designed to overcome this particular obstacle. The difficulties students have with passive voice are highlighted by Lubis (2021) and include subject identification, verb form use, and verb use. According to the report, a lot of pupils don't have a solid basis in passive voice. This highlights the need to provide students with thorough explanations, focus their practice on particular problems, and make sure they grasp the fundamentals before advancing to more complicated tenses like the past continuous.

The study of Batubara et al. (2020), draws attention to several difficulties and constraints in teaching passive voice, especially when switching from active to passive speech. These include issues with identifying the subject, applying the verb3 in the passive voice, and utilizing the auxiliary verb "be." Furthermore, the fact that students depend so heavily on resources like dictionaries suggests that there is room for improvement in their comprehension and usage of English grammar, which may restrict the efficacy of the existing teaching strategies. The use of accurate grammar may take precedence over the use of the passive voice when instructing pupils to write, as highlighted by Abdul Halik & Fouzul Kareema (2020). Students may not utilize the voice correctly even when they have solid grammar knowledge. According to the study, additional writing exercises emphasizing the use of passive voice in context are necessary. This might be achieved by teaching grammar more conversationally.

3. Methodology

3.1 Method

The author's goal in doing this research was to examine current practices and useful methods for teaching passive voice. A thorough analysis of pertinent publications published during the seven most recent years served as the source for gathering data for this project (2018–2024). Finding and evaluating primary studies, journal papers, and conference proceedings that addressed different approaches and developments in teaching passive voice was the main goal of this project.

3.2 Data Collection

Academic resources including Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar were provided the data for this study. Among the search terms that were used were "passive voice teaching," "strategies," "trends," and "effectiveness." A comprehensive evaluation of thirty primary scientific publications were conducted, with selection determined by quality and relevancy.

3.3 Data Selection

The chosen papers come from eight highly regarded journals in the field of education, and two conference proceedings. These resources provided the researcher with a thorough rundown of current developments and practical passive voice teaching techniques.

3.4 Data Analysis

The chosen articles underwent a thematic analysis and review process. The term "thematic analysis" is commonly utilized in research investigations and is therefore categorized as qualitative research; however, just declaring that an analysis of this kind was carried out does not automatically indicate a comprehensive qualitative inquiry (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018). Finding recurring themes, patterns, and trends in the literature was the goal of this approach. The examination centered on the techniques employed in passive voice instruction, their efficacy, and any drawbacks or restrictions related to them.

3.5 Data Synthesis

The results of the thematic analysis were combined to give a summary of current developments and useful approaches for teaching passive voice. Key conclusions and insights from the literature review were highlighted in an understandable and well-organized presentation of the synthesized data.

4. Results and Discussion

Table 1
Data Collection from selected articles on passive voice teaching strategies and trends from 2018 to 2024

Sl No.	Article Title	Author(s)	Pub. Year	Source (Journal/Conference)	Focus/Key Points
1	"Learning the English Passive Voice: Difficulties, Learning	Amadi	2018	Journal	Difficulties

	Strategies of Igbo ESL Learners and Pedagogical Implications”				
2	“Where Grammar, Content, and Professional Practice Meet: The Case of the Passive Voice”	Conrad et al	2018	Conference	Intersectionality
3	“Repetition Brings Success: Revealing Knowledge of the Passive Voice”	Deen et al	2018	Conference	Repetition
4	“Error Analysis in Using Passive Voice”	Yasim et al	2018	Journal	Error Analysis
5	“Teaching Passive Voice Sentences Through Collaborative Learning”	Pereira et al	2019	Journal	Collaborative Learning
6	“The Use of EGRA Technique in Teaching Passive Voice for EFL Classroom”	Zaenap	2019	Journal	EGRA Technique
7	“The Effectiveness of Inductive Teaching Method in Teaching Passive Voice for High School Students”	Zulfikar et al	2019	Journal	Inductive Teaching
8	“An Analysis on Students’ Difficulties in Changing Active to Passive Voice”	Batubara & Mahardhika	2020	Journal	Error Analysis
9	“The Passive Voice in Scientific Writing Through the Ages: A Diachronic Study”	Leong	2020	Journal	Diachronic Study
10	“Developing Teaching Instructions Through the Practice of Lesson Study in Teaching Passive Voice”	Mallipa & Murianty	2020	Journal	Lesson Study
11	“The Efficacy of Using Passive Voice Cards in Teaching Grammar”	Shanty	2020	Journal	Passive Voice Cards
12	“Contrastive Analysis of Using Active and Passive Sentence in the Novel of “Eat, Pray, and Love” by Margaret Gilbert”	Haryani & Hartanto	2021	Conference	Constructive Analysis
13	“Analyzing EFL Students’ Ability in Identifying Passive Voice”	Julianita et al	2021	Conference	Identification Ability
14	“Transitioning from Passive to Active Learning: Preparing Future Project Leaders”	Karyne et al	2021	Journal	Transitioning
15	“Translation Method of Passive Voice in I Am Number Four Novel: An English - Indonesian Translation Evaluation”	Sutopo et al	2021	Conference	Translation Method
16	“Teaching Passive Voice by Using Task-Based Learning	Diyata	2022	Journal	Task-Based Learning

	with Integrated Steps in a Procedural Form”				
17	“Analysis of Students’ Ability and their Difficulties in Identifying Passive Voice”	Fitria & Muliarsari	2022	Journal	Identification Ability
18	“A Case Study of Students’ Barriers in Passive Voice Sentences”	Idami & Pratiwi	2022	Journal	Barriers
19	“A Review of Teaching Passive Voice Strategy”	Islamy & Kaniadew	2022	Journal	Review
20	“Digital Story-Telling in the Specification of Active and Passive Voice from High School English Language Education”	Roy & Sumanjari	2022	Conference	Digital Story Telling
21	“Students’ Error of Using Passive Voice Based on Surface Strategy Taxonomy”	Suprpto et al	2022	Journal	Error Analysis
22	“Authentic Texts as a Resource for Designing Passive Voice Exercises for Students of English for Law Enforcement”	Trajkovska	2022	Conference	Authentic Texts
23	“Complex Prepositions in Philippine English: A Corpus Analysis”	Amante	2023	Conference	Prepositions
24	“Shaping Attributions of Crisis Responsibility in the Case of an Accusation: The Role of Active and Passive Voice in Crisis Response Strategies”	Fannes & Claeys	2023	Journal	Crisis Communication
25	“The Effectiveness of Jigsaw Technique in Teaching Passive Voice”	Hadi, S.	2023	Journal	Jigsaw Technique
26	“The Passive Voice: Challenges and Suggestions for English Language Teaching”	Rotko & Danilova	2023	Conference	Challenges
27	“The Dynamics of Active and Passive Voice in English Grammar”	Safarova	2023	Journal	Dynamics
28	“Teaching and Assessing the English Passive Voice Inductively”	Brenes	2024	Journal	Inductive Teaching
29	“Passive Voice and Active Voice in Sentence Structure”	Lubis et al	2024	Journal	Sentence Structure
30	“Investigating Passive Voice Problems in Kurdish Students’ Translation from and into English”	Sherzad & Toma	2024	Journal	Translation Problems

Table 2: Themes, Patterns and Trends in Selected Research on Teaching Passive Voice

S.No	Author/s	Year	Themes	Patterns	Trends
1	Amadi	2018	Learning Igbo ESL students have trouble comprehending passive voice	Sentence construction difficulties, tense changes, verb conjugation problems, and difficulty identifying the passive auxiliary "be"	Utilizing a positive mindset, connecting transitive verbs to the passive voice, and learning passive sentence structures
2	Pereira et al.	2019	Effect of cooperative learning on students' understanding of passive voice in the seventh grade	Students' comprehension significantly improved through collaborative learning, as evidenced by their improved post-test results	In terms of efficacy, collaborative learning did better than the usual method
3	Zulfikar et al.	2019	Comparing the standard passive voice teaching method with inductive teaching	Increased memory retention, emphasis on student participation and thinking, and higher understanding with inductive teaching	Enhancing students' understanding of passive voice through inductive teaching might be beneficial, particularly for eleventh graders
4	Batubara & Mahardhika	2020	Students' difficulties changing active voice phrases into various passive voice tenses	The most challenging tenses to identify are the past, future, and past future perfect tenses; a particular cognitive level must be attained	Some tenses in passive voice translation are difficult to acquire; learning passive voice requires a firm grasp of tenses
5	Julianita et al	2021	Assessment of learners' comprehension and application of passive voice in	The ability to recognize passive sentences well, the challenge of converting active phrases to passive	To help students utilize passive voice more effectively, grammar instruction for

			English language instruction	voice, and the necessity for more efficient grammar instruction in passive voice formation	passive voice creation has to be enhanced
6	Islam & Kaniadewi	2022	Analysis of passive voice teaching techniques	Flashcards, the EGRA technique, group projects, task-based instruction, favorable results with NHT, TGN, passive boxes, ICT integration, inductive teaching, music and motion, and lyrics from videos	A range of instructional methods that enhance passive voice learning, the necessity of giving time considerable thought, teacher training, and the incorporation of ICT
7	Roy & Sumanjari	2022	Comparing the traditional method of teaching active and passive speech with web-based storytelling	Web-based storytelling improves comprehension and output; advantages include self-directed learning, emotional connection, and cooperation	The use of web-based storytelling in active and passive voice instruction can enhance student comprehension and engagement
8	Hadi	2023	Comparing the effectiveness of the Jigsaw methodology with a traditional passive voice teaching method	Jigsaw learning enhances understanding and memory and encourages group learning	Jigsaw instruction is a useful tool for improving students' recall and understanding of passive voice
9	Safarova	2023	Thorough comprehension of the active and passive voices in a variety of contexts	For academic writing, use passive voice; for narrative, use active voice; and remember that context is crucial when choosing a voice for successful communication	For efficient communication, context-based instruction in both active and passive voice is essential. A deliberate approach to voice choice is also recommended
10	Lubis et al	2024	The impact of active vs passive	Active voice is preferable for	More research is required to

			voice in academic writing on reading and comprehension	clarity and can increase comprehension in some situations. Passive speech often results in poorer reading and comprehension	properly teach situational passive voice usage, particularly to EFL students
--	--	--	--	---	--

4.1 Recent Trends and Effective Strategies

4.1.1 CCLMethod

The difficulties Igbo ESL learners encounter in understanding the use of the passive voice are examined in Amadi's (2018) study. These difficulties include trouble recognizing the employment of the passive auxiliary "be" and differentiating it from other forms, as well as difficulties with verb conjugation, tense alterations, and sentence construction. The study emphasizes the application of many learning methodologies, including retaining an optimistic outlook, associating transitive verbs with passive voice, and committing to memory passive sentence structures. The study suggests the CCL method for explicit instruction that contrasts active and passive voice with real-life materials to address these challenges. It also suggests hierarchical teaching, which starts with transitive verbs and progresses to more complex structures, and a focus on the methodical presentation of features of passive verb phrases in comparison to their active counterparts. Although these approaches have the potential to improve learning by presenting distinct contrasts and gradually increasing information, the study did not evaluate their efficacy in comparison to current techniques. Furthermore, not all learner requirements may be met by the emphasis on explicit instruction, and alternate teaching modalities are rarely investigated.

4.1.2 Collaborative Learning

To determine how collaborative learning affected seventh-grade students' grasp of passive voice, Pereira et al. (2019) performed research. To assess the efficacy of this teaching strategy, the study used a pre-test and post-test approach. The post-test mean score increased from 4.3 (very low level) to 6.8, indicating a considerable improvement in students' grasp of passive voice, according to the results. These results were further corroborated by the t-test value of 11.2 which was higher than the essential t-table value of 2.056. According to the study's findings, collaborative learning outperformed the prior standard approach in terms of effectiveness. The conversation made clear that more student participation and engagement with collaborative learning probably resulted in a deeper comprehension of passive voice. The research, however, only looked at grade 7 children in a particular school setting and did not examine the precise collaborative learning strategies used.

4.1.3 Inductive Teaching

To improve passive speech understanding, Zulfikar et al. (2019), study compared the efficacy of inductive teaching with a traditional approach. In contrast to typical education, the study topic sought to ascertain if inductive teaching may improve passive voice understanding. Two groups participated in the study; one received traditional training and the other inductive

teaching. The post-test results showed that the inductive group's pupils had much higher scores, indicating that their comprehension had increased. The advantages of inductive teaching were emphasized during the debate, including how it promotes student involvement and thinking, which results in active learning and improved memory retention. The method's novelty may have raised student interest, and learning within the inductive framework was made easier by prior grammatical understanding. Collaboration and understanding were also promoted via group work. With an impact size of 0.604, which suggests a medium positive effect, it can be concluded that inductive teaching is a useful strategy for enhancing students' grasp of passive voice, especially those in the eleventh grade.

4.1.4 Error Analysis

The goal of Batubara and Mahardhika's (2020) study was to determine the challenges students encountered while converting active voice sentences into different passive voice tenses. Exam results from active-to-passive voice transformation tasks were analyzed, instructor and student interviews were conducted, and course materials were reviewed as part of the study approach. The findings showed that the past, future, and past future perfect tenses were the biggest challenges for the pupils. On the other hand, mistakes dropped in tenses such as the past perfect and infinitive, indicating a certain comprehension level. According to interviews, tense identification was a major problem for the students. According to the study, students have the most difficulty learning certain tenses when it comes to passive voice translation. It was mentioned that learning passive voice requires a solid basis in tense understanding, but the research did not look into particular teaching strategies to deal with these challenges. The study was restricted to a particular educational setting and concentrated on STAIN Gajah Putih Takengon fourth-semester students.

4.1.5 Digital Story Telling

Research comparing web-based storytelling to a conventional approach to teaching active and passive voice was carried out by Roy and Sumanjari (2020). When compared to learners who were taught using traditional techniques, the research revealed that learners who were taught via web-based storytelling had a better understanding and production of both active and passive voice sentences. The benefits of web-based storytelling were discussed; these included encouraging learners to collaborate and share knowledge, improving their emotional connection to the material, and supporting self-directed, learner-centered grammar acquisition. Digital technologies have also been shown to enhance problem-solving and critical thinking abilities, as well as to customize instruction and meet the needs of each individual. The study did not, however, identify the web-based storytelling tools that were employed or evaluate any possible negatives, such as technological reliance or accessibility concerns.

4.1.6 Identification Ability

In research published in 2021, Julianita et al. evaluated how well students in the English language education programs could recognize and use passive voice. 77 fourth-semester students participated in the study, and the exam consisted of three sections: finding passive sentences in explanatory texts, noting the passive phrases found, and converting active words to passive voice. The findings demonstrated that while students did a good job of recognizing passive sentences, they had trouble changing active phrases to passive voice. It was difficult to use the auxiliary verb "to be" appropriately, to preserve tense consistency, and

to ensure that the subject and the auxiliary verb agreed, even if the mean score showed a decent overall knowledge. These results point to the need for more effective passive voice construction grammar education.

4.1.7 Review on Various Strategies

A thorough analysis of eight passive voice teaching techniques was carried out by Islam & Kaniadewi (2022) between 2017 and 2022, showcasing a range of techniques that improve passive voice learning. Using flashcards is one of the most effective ways; it has been demonstrated to improve writing abilities, understanding, and motivation. Gaining better comprehension, grammatical proficiency, and soft skills has also been demonstrated to be possible with the EGRA approach. While cooperative learning using techniques like NHT and TGN has demonstrated beneficial results, task-based learning aids students in gaining a grasp of passive voice procedures. Positive outcomes have also been recorded for other strategies such as the passive box, ICT integration, inductive education, motion and song, and video lyrics. The EGRA method's time commitment, the requirement for teacher preparation, and the necessity of backup plans for ICT integration are all factors to take into account.

4.18 Jigsaw Technique

Hadi (2023) carried out research evaluating the Jigsaw technique's efficacy against a conventional approach to teaching passive voice. A 30-item multiple-choice exam covering several passive voice tenses was used in the study. The Jigsaw methodology experimental class had a considerably better improvement in scores than the conventional method control group, according to the results. The Jigsaw method encouraged better comprehension by fostering a collaborative learning environment with more student involvement and participation. The study, however, did not examine the particulars of the Jigsaw technique's application or any potential drawbacks.

4.1.9 Dynamics

Safarova's (2023) research provides a comprehensive understanding of the use of active and passive voices in a variety of settings, such as academic writing, legal papers, and journalism. According to the study, passive voice stresses action/result and objectivity, making it good for formal writing, whereas active voice emphasizes the topic, clarity, and immediacy, making it excellent for captivating storytelling. The study emphasizes how crucial context is when selecting the right voice for a certain situation to communicate effectively. This has consequences for education, indicating that context-based training on the use of active and passive voice is necessary, as well as for linguistics, emphasizing grammar as a tool for communication rather than merely a set of rules. Depending on their communication objectives, learners are advised to adopt a strategic approach to employing active or passive voice. The research did not, however, discuss particular active/passive voice teaching strategies or any implementation issues.

4.1.10 Sentence Structure

Lubis et al. (2024) examine nine studies to determine the impact of using active voice compared to passive voice in academic writing on understanding and readability. They discover that as compared to active voice, passive voice typically produces poor reading and understanding. Texts written in the active voice had better processing speeds, higher Flesch

Reading Ease scores, and fewer grammatical mistakes. Even while active voice is usually preferable for clarity, there are some situations when the thoughtful application of passive voice can improve comprehension, such as emphasizing the object or receiver or demystifying difficult scientific topics. The decision between active and passive voice is influenced by the reader's prior knowledge and the rhetorical objectives. Nevertheless, little study has been done on how best to teach situational passive voice usage, especially to EFL students.

4.2 Current Developments and Useful Approaches for Teaching Passive Voice

To overcome the difficulties that students have when learning passive voice, recent research has elucidated several useful teaching strategies. The EGRA technique, task-based learning, cooperative learning, web-based storytelling, and the usage of flashcards are some of these strategies. It has been demonstrated that using flashcards improves writing, understanding, and motivation. The EGRA approach improves comprehension, grammatical proficiency, and soft skills. While cooperative learning promotes comprehension and participation, task-based learning aids students in mastering passive voice methods. Storytelling on the web encourages participation, emotional connection, and independent learning. Furthermore, it has been discovered that inductive instruction and the Jigsaw method enhance comprehension and recall. These strategies should be used cautiously, though, taking into account things like time limits, reliance on technology, and the requirement for teacher preparation.

4.3 Key Conclusions and Insights

In response to the difficulties that students have when learning passive voice, recent studies have uncovered several useful teaching methods. Using flashcards, the EGRA technique, task-based learning, cooperative learning, and web-based storytelling are some of these strategies. It has been demonstrated that the EGRA approach improves knowledge, grammar, and soft skills, while flashcards boost motivation, comprehension, and writing abilities. While cooperative learning promotes comprehension and teamwork, task-based learning helps students comprehend passive voice techniques. Storytelling on the web encourages participation, emotional connection, and independent learning. Furthermore, it has been discovered that inductive instruction and the Jigsaw method enhance comprehension and recall. These strategies should be used carefully though, taking into account things like time limits, reliance on technology, and the requirement for teacher preparation. Contextual elements are important in choosing the right voice overall, which highlights the value of context-based learning. Effective teaching methods for situational passive voice usage, especially for EFL learners, require more investigation.

Research Question 1: New Directions in Passive Voice Instruction Plans

The passive voice Approaches to education are changing to become more interactive and captivating, such as web-based storytelling, cooperative learning, and task-based learning. By using these techniques, passive voice learning seeks to become less formal and more applicable than it was in the past.

Research Question 2: Successful Methods of Teaching Passive Voice

Task-based learning, cooperative learning, inductive teaching, the EGRA approach, and the use of flashcards are effective strategies for teaching passive voice. These techniques

have been demonstrated to enhance students' understanding, grammatical proficiency, and soft skills, demonstrating how well they support the acquisition of passive voice.

Research Question 3: Incorporating Real-World Scenarios and Realistic Materials in Passive Voice Instruction

By adding legitimate texts that utilize passive voice, such as news stories, scientific papers, and legal documents, real-world circumstances and realistic materials may be added into passive voice education. Additionally, students can better relate to and comprehend passive voice in context when examples are drawn from their own experiences or current affairs.

Research Question 4: Learner-Centered Techniques to Improve Instruction Using Passive Voice

Keeping a positive attitude, connecting transitive verbs to passive voice, and memorizing passive sentence patterns are learner-centered strategies that can enhance the teaching of passive voice. These strategies center on involving students in the process of learning and adjusting the curriculum to suit each student's unique requirements and preferences.

Research Question 5: Influence of Technology-Assisted Learning Aids on Teaching Passive Voice

By offering captivating and dynamic learning experiences, technology-assisted teaching tools like interactive online platforms can improve the teaching of passive voice. These tools, which assist in reinforcing passive voice topics and make learning more engaging and efficient, might include instructional games, quizzes, and movies.

Research Question 6: Increasing Student Performance by Implementing Strategies into Lesson Plans

By carefully designing and integrating these strategies into the curriculum, language instructors can improve student performance by including them in their lesson plans. Teachers may create a dynamic learning environment where students are motivated to engage and learn by including a range of interesting and interactive activities. Giving pupils prompt feedback and encouragement can also help them remain on course and gradually develop their passive voice abilities.

4.4 Implications of the Findings

The research's conclusions have several implications for teaching passive voice. First of all, they emphasize how crucial it is to employ a range of instructional strategies to meet the various requirements of students. Strategies like task-based learning, web-based storytelling, and the EGRA method can improve student understanding and engagement. The study also highlights the necessity of context-based learning to assist students in knowing when to employ passive voice effectively. According to these results, teachers should teach passive voice flexibly and creatively that incorporates technology and real-world situations to improve student learning outcomes.

4.5 Comparison with Other Studies

The present study's outcomes are consistent with other investigations on passive voice training, which underscore the need to employ diverse and captivating pedagogical approaches. Research has consistently demonstrated that innovative educational approaches, like task-based instruction and cooperative education, outperform conventional techniques. In a similar vein, it has been discovered that using technology to improve student engagement and understanding includes using web-based storytelling. Overall, this present investigation adds to the corpus of research by offering more proof of these techniques' efficacy in teaching passive voice.

4.6 Suggestions for Implementation

Several practical suggestions may be made in light of the study's findings. First, while teaching passive voice, teachers should use a range of instructional strategies, such as the EGRA approach, task-based learning, and web-based storytelling. These techniques can increase student engagement and comprehension. Teachers should also concentrate on giving students the opportunity for context-based learning so they can comprehend when and how to utilize the passive voice. Finally, for certain successful learning results, teachers should recurrently evaluate students' comprehension and modify their pedagogical approaches accordingly.

4.7 Recommendations for Further Research

This study suggests various directions for future investigation. First, further investigation might be conducted into the long-term impacts of various pedagogical approaches on the learning outcomes of students receiving passive voice instruction. Furthermore, studies should look at how particular contextual elements, including cultural variations, affect how well passive voice instruction works. Subsequent investigations may also examine the possibility of integrating diverse pedagogical approaches to increase student involvement and understanding. To enhance student learning results, future research should investigate creative and practical methods of passive voice training.

5. Conclusion

With an emphasis on finding successful approaches, including real-world scenarios and resources, using learner-centered methodologies (Errington, 2008; An & Mindrila, 2020), and applying technology-assisted learning aids (Fletcher, 2003; Haron et al., 2019), the research explored current trends and effective ways of teaching passive voice. Following a thorough examination of the literature, several important conclusions were drawn. It was determined that there are several efficient ways to teach passive voice, including the EGRA methodology, task-based learning, cooperative learning, flashcards, and web-based storytelling. It has been demonstrated that using these strategies enhances learning outcomes, understanding, and student engagement. Furthermore, context-based learning was found to be essential for comprehending when and how to utilize passive voice effectively, emphasizing the necessity of adaptable teaching techniques that take into account real-world scenarios. It has been discovered that the use of technology in education, especially web-based storytelling, improves student engagement and knowledge of subjects related to passive voice. Additionally, it was discovered that the Jigsaw technique and inductive training improved students' memory and comprehension of passive voice. These strategies should be applied

carefully though, keeping in mind things like time constraints, the need for teacher preparation, and reliance on technology. The study concludes that to effectively fulfill the different requirements of students in passive voice education, it is critical to use a range of instructional strategies (Moore, 2014). Among them, active learning approaches and the incorporation of technology and real-world scenarios prove to be especially successful. Future studies should examine the effects of different educational strategies over the long run (De Boer et al., 2018; Braga et al., 2013) as well as the impact of contextual factors on teaching passive voice. Through the integration of varied teaching methodologies (Johnson et al., 2012) and the utilization of technology (Venkatesan, 2023), educators may craft compelling and impactful learning experiences for students, which in turn improves their understanding and application of topics related to passive voice.

References

- [1] Abdul Halik, A. F., & Fouzul Kareema, M. I. (2020). Difficulties faced by the ESL learners in using English passive voice in written communication: A study based on the Students of NAITA, Trincomalee, Sri Lanka. *KALAM - International Research Journal*, 13(3), 51-59. <http://ir.lib.seu.ac.lk/handle/123456789/5285>
- [2] Alda Raudatul, J. A. N. N. A. H. (2023). *Problems in writing passive voice: A case study in the EFL classes*. [Doctoral dissertation], Universitas Mataram. <http://eprints.unram.ac.id/id/eprint/43207>
- [3] Aliakbari, M., & Jamalvandi, B. (2010). The impact of role play on fostering EFL learners' speaking Ability: A task-based approach. *Journal of Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, 14(1), 15-29. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ920501>
- [4] Amadi, S. C. (2018). Learning the English passive voice: Difficulties, learning strategies of Igbo ESL learners and pedagogical implications. *International Journal of English and Literature*, 9(5), 50-62. <https://doi.org/10.5897/IJEL2018.1146>
- [5] An, Y., & Mindrila, D. (2020). Strategies and tools used for learner-centered instruction. *International Journal of Technology in Education and Science*, 4(2), 133-143. <http://dx.doi.org/10.46328/ijtes.v4i2.74>
- [6] Batubara, M. H., & Mahardhika, M. G. S. (2020). An analysis on students' difficulties in changing active to passive voice. *Journal As-Salam*, 4(1), 61-78. <http://dx.doi.org/10.37249/as-salam.v4i1.175>
- [7] Benson, P. (2013). *Teaching and researching: Autonomy in language learning*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315833767>
- [8] Bielak, J., & Pawlak, M. (2013). *Applying cognitive grammar in the foreign language classroom: Teaching English tense and aspect*. Heidelberg: Springer. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-27455-8>
- [9] Braga, M., Checchi, D., & Meschi, E. (2013). Educational policies in a long-run perspective. *Economic Policy*, 28(73), 45-100. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-0327.12002>
- [10] Cameron, D. (2001). *Working with spoken discourse*: SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://www.torrossa.com/gs/resourceProxy?an=4913940&publisher=FZ7200>
- [11] Castleberry, A., & Nolen, A. (2018). Thematic analysis of qualitative research data: Is it as easy as it sounds? *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, 10(6), 807-815. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cptl.2018.03.019>
- [12] Charles, M. (2013). Active and passive voice in research articles: An interdisciplinary study. *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics*, 18(3), 279-318.
- [13] Crosthwaite, P., & Steeples, B. (2022). Data-driven learning with younger learners:

- Exploring corpus-assisted development of the passive voice for science writing with female secondary school students. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 1-48. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2022.2068615>
- [14] Darsih, E. (2018). Learner-centered teaching: What makes it effective. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 4(1), 33-42. <http://dx.doi.org/10.25134/ieflj.v4i1.796>
- [15] De Boer, H., Donker, A. S., Kostons, D. D., & Van der Werf, G. P. (2018). Long-term effects of metacognitive strategy instruction on student academic performance: A meta-analysis. *Educational Research Review*, 24, 98-115. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2018.03.002>
- [16] De Graaff, R., & Housen, A. (2009). Investigating the effects and effectiveness of L2 instruction. In M. H. Long, & C. J. Doughty (Eds.), *The handbook of language teaching* (pp. 726-755). Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/9781444315783>
- [17] Diyata, F. (2022). Teaching passive voice by using task-based learning with integrated steps in a procedural form. *JEPAL: Journal of English Pedagogy and Applied Linguistics*, 3(1), 45-55. <https://doi.org/10.32627/jepal.v3i1.542>
- [18] Doughty, C. J. (2003). Instructed SLA: Constraints, compensation, and enhancement. In C. J. Doughty, & M. H. Long (Eds.), *The handbook of second language acquisition* (pp. 256-310). Oxford: Blackwell. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/9780470756492.ch10>
- [19] Fitria, T. N., & Muliasari, D. (2022). Analysis of students' ability and their difficulties in identifying passive voice. *Journal of English Education*, 7(1), 46-54.
- [20] Errington, E. P. (2008). Exploring real-world scenarios as vehicles for authentic learning. *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences*, 3, 1-5. <http://dx.doi.org/10.18848/1833-1882/CGP/v03i05/52619>
- [21] Fletcher, J. D. (2003). Evidence for learning from technology-assisted instruction. In H. F. O'Neil, Jr. & R. S. Perez (Eds.), *Technology applications in education: A learning view* (pp. 79-99). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.
- [22] Geeraerts, D. (2006). A rough guide to Cognitive Linguistics. In D. Geeraerts, R. Dirven, J. R. Taylor, & R. W. Langacker (Eds.), *Cognitive Linguistics: Basic Readings* (pp. 1-28). Berlin, New York: De Gruyter Mouton. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110199901>
- [23] Hadi, S. (2023). The effectiveness of jigsaw technique in teaching passive voice. *Journal Corner of Education, Linguistics, and Literature*, 3(2), 121-133. <https://doi.org/10.54012/jcell.v3i2.208>
- [24] Halim, S. (2020). The efficacy of using passive voice cards in teaching grammar. *Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning Linguistics and Literature*, 8(2), 474-483. <https://doi.org/10.24256/ideas.v9i1.1690>
- [25] Halliday, M. A., & Matthiessen, C. M. I. M. (2013). *An Introduction to Functional Grammar*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203783771>
- [26] Haron, M. Z., Othman, M. K. H., & Awang, M. I. (2019). Technology-assisted teaching aids in teaching and learning: Evidence from the Malaysian Tahfiz Ulul Albab Model (TMUA). *International Journal of Innovative Technology and Exploring Engineering*, 8(12), 4401-4404. <http://dx.doi.org/10.35940/ijitee.L3915.1081219>
- [27] Healey, D. (2016). Language learning and technology: Past, present and future. In F. Farr, & L. Murray (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of language learning and technology* (pp. 9-23). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315657899>
- [28] Islamy, S. P., & Kaniadewi, N. (2022). A review of teaching passive voice strategy. *EPIGRAM (e-Journal)*, 19(2), 183-197. <http://dx.doi.org/10.32722/epi.v19i2.4820>

- [29] Jalilifar, A., & Shooshtari, Z. G. (2011). Active or passive: That is the question. *BRAIN: Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience*, 2(4), 29-38.
- [30] Jannah, A. R., Wilian, S., Zamzam, A., Arafiq, A., & Arfah, H. (2023). Problems in writing passive voice: A case study in the EFL classes. *Journal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 8(4), 2644–2651. <https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v8i4.1775>
- [31] Johnson, E. O., Charchanti, A. V., & Troupis, T. G. (2012). Modernization of an anatomy class: From conceptualization to implementation. A case for integrated multimodal–multidisciplinary teaching. *Anatomical Sciences Education*, 5(6), 354-366. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ase.1296>
- [32] Julianita, G. M., Mariani, N., & Amelia, R. (2021). *Analyzing EFL students' ability in identifying passive voice. Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Education, Language, Literature, and Arts (ICELLA)*, [89-98]. <https://conference.ulm.ac.id/index.php/icella/icella/paper/viewPaper/295>
- [33] Lubis, A. (2021). The students difficulties in understanding of active to passive voice at X Tm SMKN 2 Panyabungan. *The Explora*, 7(1), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.51622/explora.v7i1.516>
- [34] Lubis, M. Y. A., Miranti, R., & Lubis, Y. (2024). Passive voice and active voice in sentence structure. *Journal of Psychology, Counseling and Education*, 2(1), 59-64. <https://psycoeducation.my.id/index.php/i/article/download/20/13>
- [35] Luo, H. (2018). *Passive voice usage in undergraduate STEM textbooks*. [PhD Dissertation], University of Central Florida. <https://sTars.library.ucf.edu/etd/5894>
- [36] Mallipa, I., & Murianty, R. (2020). Developing teaching instructions through the practice of lesson study in teaching passive voice. *Linguistic, English Education and Art (LEEA) Journal*, 3(2), 385-399. <https://doi.org/10.31539/leea.v3i2.1256>
- [37] Moore, K. D. (2014). *Effective instructional strategies: From theory to practice*. Sage Publications.
- [38] Muziatun, M., Malabar, F., & Mustapa, L. (2022). Analyzing students' passive voice difficulties. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 8(2), 155-164.
- [39] Nassaji, H., & Fotos, S. S. (2011). *Teaching grammar in second language classrooms: Integrating form-focused instruction in communicative context*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203850961>
- [40] Nourdad, N., & Aghayi, E. T. (2014). Focus on form in teaching passive voice of different tenses. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 98, 1400-1408. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.558>
- [41] Oshima, A., & Hogue, A. (2007). *Introduction to Academic Writing*. Pearson Longman.
- [42] Pereira, S., Sarmiento, J. A., & Fernandes, B. F. (2019). Teaching passive voice sentences through collaborative learning. *ISCE: Journal of Innovative Studies on Character and Education*, 3(1), 19-40. <http://iscjournal.com/index.php/isce/article/download/49/42>
- [43] Richards, J. C., & Rodgers, T. S. (2014). *Approaches and methods in language teaching*. Cambridge University Press. <https://www.english-efl.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/Communicative-Language-Teaching.pdf>
- [44] Roy, A., Sumanjari, S. (2020). *Digital story-telling in the specification of active and passive voice from high school English language education. The 4th International Conference on Innovative Research in Education*. <https://www.dpublication.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/66-250.pdf>
- [45] Saeidi, M., & Sahebkhair, F. (2011). The application of passive voice in the Iranian EFL learners' writings. *English Language Teaching*, 4(1), 208-213.
- [46] Safarova, L. (2023). The dynamics of active and passive voice in English grammar.

- Norwegian Journal of Development of the International Science*, 121, 84- 89.
<https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10246770>
- [47] Shabani, K., Bakhshi, E. M., & Samarghandi, S. (2016). The effect of textual enhancement through technology on the intake of active and passive voice and belief about grammar instruction. *International Journal of Humanities and Cultural Studies*, 3(2), 1563-1578.
<https://www.academia.edu/download/83811923/2655.pdf>
- [48] Trajkovska, V. (2022). Authentic texts as a resource for designing passive voice exercises for students of English for law enforcement. *International Scientific Conference 45 Years Higher Education in the Area of Security – Educational Challenges and Security Perspectives* [3(6), 39-48].
<https://eprints.uklo.edu.mk/id/eprint/7248>
- [49] Unver, M. M. (2017). On voice in English: An awareness raising attempt on passive voice. *European Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 2(3), 17-29.
<https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.836096>
- [50] Venkatesan, S. (2023). Utilization of media skills and technology use among students and educators in the state of New York. *Neuroquantology*, 21(5), 111-124.
<https://doi.org/10.48047/nq.2023.21.5.NQ222010>
- [51] Yannuar, N., Shitadevi, I. A., Basthomi, Y., & Widiati, U. (2014). Active and passive voice constructions by Indonesian student writers. *Theory & Practice in Language Studies*, 4(7), 1400-1408. <https://doi.org/10.4304/tpls.4.7.1400-1408>
- [52] Zaenap, S. (2019). The use of EGRA technique in teaching passive voice for EFL classroom. *VELES: Voices of English Language Education Society*, 3(1), 24-30.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.29408/veles.v3i1.1019>
- [53] Zohrabi, M., Torabi, M. A., & Baybourdiani, P. (2012). Teacher-centered and/or student centered learning: English language in Iran. *English Language and Literature Studies*, 2(3), 18-30. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ells.v2n3p18>
- [54] Zulfikar, K., Sutapa, R., & Sutapa, Y. G. (2019). The effectiveness of inductive teaching method in teaching passive voice for high school students. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Khatulistiwa*, 8(2).
https://jurnal.untan.ac.id/index.php/j_pdpb/article/view/31371